

Town of Brookline
Advisory Committee Minutes

Sean Lynn-Jones, Chair

Date: March 15, 2016

Present: Carla Benka, Clifford M. Brown, Carol Caro, Lea Cohen, John Doggett, Harry K. Friedman, Janet Gelbart, David-Marc Goldstein, Jennifer Goldsmith, Neil Gordon, Kelly Hardebeck, Sytske Humphrey, Angela Hyatt, Janice S. Kahn, Bobbie Knable, Robert Liao, Pamela Lodish, Sean M. Lynn-Jones, Shaari S. Mittel, Mariah Nobrega, Michael Sandman, Charles Swartz, Christine Westphal.

Absent: * Dennis Doughty, Amy F. Hummel, Alisa Jonas, Steve Kanes, Fred Levitan, Lee Selwyn, Stanley Spiegel

The meeting was called to order at 7:30 PM.

Also in attendance: Melissa Goff, Deputy Town Administrator; Charlie Simmons, Director of Public Buildings; Dan Bennett, Building Commissioner

REVIEW OF FY2017 BUDGET: BUILDING DEPARTMENT AND BUILDING DEPARTMENT CIP

Pam Lodish presented the report of the Capital Subcommittee. The Building Department's FY 2017 requested budget of \$7,468,481 starts on page IV-56 of the Town Administrator's FY 17 Financial Plan. It reflects a \$71,177 (1.0%) increase. Basically this means that the Building Department budget is level funded.

One great need is a shop where the Director of Public Buildings can centralize storage and shop space. This space doesn't even have to be in Brookline. It could be in Brighton or Jamaica Plain for example. Right now shop storage is spread out all over Town and is quite inefficient.

The subcommittee discussed maintenance of buildings and preventive maintenance to avoid failures and overtime. Expansion of facilities with less staffing should be of concern; there is a limit to what they can do with resources available. It feels as if the department is being asked to do more with less and this should be a significant concern to our community.

Public Buildings Division recently contracted with the Matrix Consulting Group to prepare a comprehensive management and operations analysis of its division. The review included management practices, organization, staffing and operations management. The goal was to identify opportunities for improvement in the effectiveness and efficiency of the division. Although the report was initiated by the PBD, the topics it raises are not trivial and it will be important for the AC, the Selectmen, and the Town, to thoroughly review the report and understand the issues that were raised as we all plan for the future of the Town.

The report is in draft form. The final document will be available soon.

A major theme throughout the report is the insufficiency of both internal staffing and contracted resources to adequately maintain the Town's 82 buildings. Health care for Town employees estimates are coming in lower than projected, therefore asking for a tradesman to be added to the PBD.

Below is the summary of the draft recommendations from the report:

- The Public Buildings Division should develop a **strategic plan** to guide operations and decision-making over a **five-year planning horizon**.
- The Public Buildings Division should develop and install a **preventive maintenance program** for all of the Town and School buildings and building components. Total cost savings could be approximately \$439,600 annually in developing and implementing the program.
- The Public Buildings Division should **contract**, initially, for the employment of **predictive testing equipment** on an annual basis. In the mid-term, the Division should selectively acquire this equipment and train its staff in its use. Short term contracting costs would be \$15,000 – \$20,000 per year.
- The Division should expand the utility of the School/Dude computerized maintenance management system to include expanded reporting of performance metrics, and enhanced communications to requesters of service.
- The Public Buildings Division should **work with the Selectman's Office** to gain a greater level of understanding of its **budget request requirements**.
- *The Public Buildings Division should enhance the content of its web site.*
- The Division should **hire nine (9) Senior Maintenance Craftspersons** over a three-year period at a total cost, including fringe benefits, of \$981,059, including salaries, fringe benefits and equipment costs
- The **annual maintenance and repair budget** for the Public Buildings Division should be **increased by an additional \$352,600 for contracted services**. This amount should be allocated between the Town and Schools on a square footage basis, and escalated each year by the Consumer Price Index to account for increases in the rates charged by contractors.
- The Public Buildings Division should adopt a consistent philosophy regarding how outsourcing decisions are made.
- The Public Buildings Division should be authorized to **hire an Energy Systems Operator** at a total compensation of \$93,800 including salary and benefits.
- The Town should consolidate the monitoring and reporting of its building energy consumption in the Public Buildings Division.

- The Town should conduct a new space needs analysis for the Public Buildings Division at an estimated cost of \$50,000.
- The Town should remove the Public Buildings Division from the Building Department and create either a stand-alone department, or transfer the Division to an existing Town department with which it has more organizational commonality
- The Division should reallocate positions to the Energy Systems Manager and the Operations Manager, and designate two existing Maintenance Craftspeople as Foremen over these units.
- The Human Resources Department should analyze the equity of the compensation level of the Public Buildings Director.

Charlie Simmons addressed the Advisory Committee. 23 years, increase in space especially the Schools. Come up with creative ways to hire a few additional people. Received another increase of \$100K from the School Department. Last request triggered the Selectman to make an inquiry about how the department was working and what could be done better. The consultant report is the result. It compared Brookline to other towns, other industry standards and made some recommendations – a few minor edits yet to do before final version is released. Appreciate that the Selectmen have given another maintenance staff person, funded by 75% School/25% Town.

Sean Cronin, Melissa, Charlie and I (Dan) agreed the timing was a bit off, came late in the budget cycle. Committed to follow through and getting some of the recommendations from the report put through. Appreciate everyone's efforts.

Questions/Comments

Q: Has any thought been given to combining with the DPW to increase workforce, provide central location for storage, maintenance and repair, increase efficiencies?

A: Study was done to consider using shared space but that didn't work out; the work is not necessarily the same.

Q: Increased salary – is there money in the budget?

A: No money in this budget.

Melissa Goff commented: When HR makes a reclassification – personal savings reserve; won't be delayed another year.

Q: Regarding the Matrix Consulting Report – predictive testing equipment what is it?

A: Measures pumps and motors, measures fine imbalances that will predict when something will fail so you can plan when to fix/replace; also measure some electrical panels to determine when there is a short so you can again, plan instead of react.

Q: 25% increase in staff? What is the rationale?

A: There are 10 tradesmen. The consultant compared us to other communities based on square foot numbers. We came out lower than the average.

Q: How is the report going to be evaluated?

A: Work with School and Town to get it funded. We have been asking for years for more money so no surprise. Surprised at what other cities and towns budget for their public building needs.

Q: Energy Systems Operator – what is that?

A: 45 energy management systems throughout various buildings. Only one person staffing that. We subcontract maintenance on these computers but by hiring a staff person it would be more cost efficient.

Q: Stand-alone department for Inspection?

A: It came from 23 years ago where Town Repairs was done via the Building Commissioner - what do public buildings have to do with building inspections? He was suggesting break it away.

Q: How are we doing in terms of building inspections?

A: Over the summer we were very short staffed, we had the Deputy Chief Inspector and a local inspector position empty – so Dan and two inspectors were it. These positions have since been filled.

Q: Do we have a current number that can tell us the relative square footage of the schools vs town?

A: 2.3 million Town, 1.5 million School.

Q: Following on the report – surprised by results of the report – do you know how often this consultant finds deficient budgets.

A: He is an efficiency expert – his goal is to make it all work – but we really don't have enough to work with – we are short on services and short on staff. He said, If I put this out there, we are not going to be taken seriously because where is the money going to come from?

Q: What are the problems we are going to face – what is wrong that we really should worry about –

A: More basic repairs done faster; on preventative maintenance – more predictive maintenance – to do that, we need more staff, better equipment. Having a pump fail in the middle of winter is unacceptable – the cost is school doesn't have any heat – but if we had predictive information, we could plan to fix it

when school is shut down in the summer. Energy management system at Devotion School – 1000 points – will he miss something? Maybe?

Q: For basic maintenance can school custodians do anything to assist on a daily basis? What is the difference?

A: Custodians were doing some basic maintenance, changing air filters for example, but looking at a series of issues – you need a degree of mechanical abilities and some training and basic understanding – so created more problems. Checking boiler, pumps, lights coming on, flag pole, generator spotting, etc. New director of Operations in School Department, and he is supporting me and that is great and we'll continue that.

Q: \$2.7 million – utilities is largest item, do you have anyone that is managing that to reduce demand? Have you conducted any comprehensive energy audits of any sites?

A: Energy management systems – load shedding. We have been funded for energy conservation, use that money to supplement rebate programs we get from electric and gas companies. Negotiate with energy companies – maybe can do something with our pump, they will come out, work out figures. Shared savings companies come in about one specific aspect – lights, for example, and they come in with a proposal for savings.

Comment: Remain cognizant of unmet needs of other departments. Put another tradesman in this year's budget. Get going on some of this, save money on some outside contractors which usually cost four times as much. Would like to include funding an additional position as the AC develops a list of potential add backs.

A MOTION was made and seconded to recommend approval of the FY2017 Building Department budget of \$7,523,922.

Vote: With a vote of 21 in favor, 0 opposed with no abstentions, the Advisory Committee recommends approval of the FY2017 Building Department budget of \$7,523,922.

REVIEW OF FY2017 BUDGET: BUILDING DEPARTMENT CIP

Carla Benka provided an overview of the Capital Subcommittee report on Building Department FY17 CIP requests. The subcommittee has recommended funding of all of the requests.

Questions and Comments

71. Q. Have you considered moving to a cloud server to replace some of the blade servers?

A. We are spending a lot of money on storage and maybe within the next 5 years – storage and possibly processing will be in the cloud. Kevin Stokes, IT director, is probably driving the bus on that.

72. Q. Are Coolidge Corner Library fenestration repairs dependent on the overall decision regarding the building?

A. Funding for CCL is in 3 different spots - FY18 for elevators and windows, existing Bond Authorization money for repointing; if decision gets delayed, slide this into a different fiscal year. The money does not go back into a Library Fund. Move something else forward.

74. Cameras at the Pierce School - working with Police Department and new principal to determine best course of action to place cameras.

Q. Are they monitored live or is it a recording that can be used after the fact?

A. School Admin looks at activity live – 4 cameras and they determine whether to let people in.

A MOTION was made and seconded for favorable action on the FY17 Building Department CIP Budget.

Note: With a vote of 21 in favor, 0 opposed, and 1 abstention, the Advisory Committee recommends favorable action on the FY17 Building Department CIP Budget.

REVIEW AND SUBCOMMITTEE ASSIGNMENTS OF WARRANT ARTICLES

<u>ARTICLE NO.</u>	<u>TITLE</u>	<u>SUBCOMMITTEE ASSIGNED</u>
1.	Appointment of Measurers of Wood and Bark. (Selectmen)	PLANNING & REGULATION
2.	Approval of Collective Bargaining Agreements. (Human Resources)	PERSONNEL
3.	Annual Authorization of Compensating Balance Agreements. (Treasurer/Collector)	ADMINISTRATION & FINANCE
4.	REPORT ON THE CLOSE-OUT OF SPECIAL APPROPRIATIONS / BOND AUTHORIZATION RESCISSION. (SELECTMEN)	CAPITAL
5.	APPROVAL OF UNPAID BILLS OF A PRIOR FISCAL YEAR. (SELECTMEN)	ADMINISTRATION & FINANCE
6.	Acceptance of Legislation to Increase Property Tax Exemptions. (Assessors)	HUMAN SERVICES
7.	FY16 Budget Amendments. (Selectmen)	ADMINISTRATION & FINANCE
8.	Annual (FY17) Appropriations Article. (Advisory Committee)	ADMINISTRATION & FINANCE
9.	Amendment to Article 3.12 of the Town's General By-laws – Department of Planning and Community Development (Town Administrator)	PLANNING & REGULATION
10.	Amendment to Article 8.23 of the Town's General By-Laws – seeking ban the sale or distribution of tobacco products. (Petition of John Ross, MD and Megan Sandel, MD)	HUMAN SERVICES
11.	Adoption of Article 8.37 of the Town's By-Laws – Tree Protection By-law. (Petition of Richard Murphy)	PUBLIC SAFETY
12.	Amendment to Table 5.01 – Table of Dimensional Requirements - of the Town's Zoning By-Law – pertaining to side yard setbacks. (Petition of Robert Murphy)	PLANNING & REGULATION

13. Amendment to Section 5.09 of the Town's Zoning By-Law – Design Review- requiring timely notice of neighborhood meetings for major impact projects. (Petition of Ernest Frey)
PLANNING & REGULATION
14. Acceptance of the provisions of Section 148C of Chapter 149 of the Massachusetts General Laws, the Earned Sick Time Law. (Petition of Patricia Connors & Cornelia H.J. van der Ziel)
PERSONNEL
15. Authorization for the granting and acquisition of permanent easements related to the Carlton Street Footbridge Rehabilitation Project. (Department of Public Works) **CAPITAL**
16. Authorization for the acquisition of temporary easements related to the Carlton Street Footbridge Rehabilitation Project. (Department of Public Works) **CAPITAL**
17. Resolution Regarding the Mechanization of Trash Pickup by the Town. (Petition of Harry Friedman)**PUBLIC SAFETY**
18. Resolution Regarding the Placement of a historic plaque at the site of the former St. Aiden's Church. (Petition of Patricia Connors) **CAPITAL**
19. Resolution Honoring former Town resident Roland Hayes. (Hidden Brookline Committee of the Town of Brookline Department of Diversity, Inclusion and Community Relations) **HUMAN SERVICES**
20. Resolution calling for an end to the U.S. Economic, Commercial, and Financial Embargo against Cuba. (Petition of Peter Miller) **SCHOOLS**
21. Resolution Affirming Brookline's Commitment to Solar Electricity (Photovoltaics). (Petition of John Harris) **CAPITAL**
22. Resolution Opposing the Trans-Pacific Partnership and Any Similar Trade Agreements (Petition of Frank Farlow and Nancy Gregg) **SCHOOLS**
23. Reports of Town Officers and Committees. (Selectmen)

Next Meeting: The next meeting of the Advisory Committee will be on March 17th

Upon a MOTION made and seconded and voted unanimously, the meeting adjourned at 9:30pm.

Documents Presented at Advisory Committee Meeting:

1. CAPITAL SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT ON BUILDING DEPARTMENT FY17 BUDGET
2. CAPITAL SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT ON BUILDING DEPARTMENT CIP
3. MATRIX CONSULTING REPORT
4. WARRANT ARTICLES