

Brookline Advisory Committee

Public Safety Subcommittee
FY23 Police Department Budget
Meeting held via Zoom 9 March 2022

Attendees included Acting Police Chief Richard Allen; Kevin Mascoll (Public Safety Business Manager); Deputy Town Administrator Melissa Goff; Deputy Superintendent Jennifer Paster (BPD); Deputy Superintendent Paul Cullinane (BPD); Sergeant Casey Hatchett (BPD); David Pilgrim (BPD); Union President Detective Michael Keaveney (BPD); Select Board Member Bernard Greene; Marty Rosenthal (TMM P9); Carla Benka (Vice Chair, AC); Mike Toffel (TMM P8); Lynda Roseman (TMM P14); Susan Granoff (AC); Katherine Florio (AC); K. Lacey; Subcommittee members Janice Kahn (Chair), Alisa Jonas, David-Marc Goldstein, Donelle O'Neal and Neil Gordon.

To view the recording click on the link and enter the passcode:

https://brooklinema.zoomgov.com/rec/share/JMFLCOI44F38ga8uVTtiQMIP-VQLWT0v2W_v6wvUxcvMdNJ_9rxYJK2dtVxoUyTn.03ZYNw4NXIHFnsOI (Passcode: j*BfWt3?)

Budget Summary:

The proposed budget for FY23 for the Brookline Police Department (BPD) is **\$17,703,841** which is an increase of **\$210,811** from FY22. \$113,802 of the increase is in salaries. Utilities are up by \$28,597, due mainly to an increase of \$30,100 for gasoline. Budgeted capital is funded at \$426,581 (an increase of \$30,412) and includes funding for 5 new vehicles, (the request for 9 cruisers in 2021 was reduced to 5). (\$300,122).

There are a number of budgetary issues that are not addressed by the published Financial Plan, most notably problems with staff recruiting, retention, inability of both the union and Town to sign a new collective bargaining agreement, as well as low morale within the department. Most of the discussion during the meeting involved issues of personnel, described in more detail later.

Unfunded and underfunded expenses include:

- Uniform stipends. This \$600 amount has not been increased for 35 years. For comparison, Boston gives each officer \$800, Cambridge \$900, and Quincy \$1,350.
- The cost of the next collective bargaining agreement. The most recent contract ended on June 30, 2020, it was a retroactive contract when approved by Town Meeting. This included a retroactive pay increase. Some of the costs of the next agreement will be needed for implementing more competitive salaries, as well as for body cameras, which is in collective bargaining negotiations. The Union recently announced that it has filed for arbitration.
- Funding for the implementation of body cameras. The BPD has received quotes ranging from \$550,000 to over \$1 million for the hardware and software. Besides the costs of the cameras themselves, there's also supporting hardware, software, along with staff training. In addition, there are additional personnel hours that will be needed to store and properly safeguard the footage. The department will need to implement new policies and guidelines, for example, deciding how long footage must be retained, under what circumstances footage might not be released, and how to respond to Public Records requests for footage.
- The department's annual training budget is typically depleted in 6 months

FY23 Budget Line Item Report

Expand All	FY21 Actuals	FY22 Budget	FY23 Budget	Variance
▶ SALARIES	\$ 16,068,228	\$ 16,137,779	\$ 16,251,582	\$ 113,802
▶ SERVICES	480,198	516,731	536,731	20,000
▶ SUPPLIES	123,868	122,857	137,857	15,000
▶ OTHER	44,155	28,300	31,300	3,000
▶ UTILITIES	241,185	291,193	319,790	28,597
▶ BUDGETED CAPITAL	326,941	396,169	426,581	30,412
Total	\$ 17,284,575	\$ 17,493,030	\$ 17,703,841	\$ 210,811

Discussion:

A copy of the 2021 Year End Report, which reports on the department's activities, accomplishments, and crime statistics (including arrests, motor vehicle stops, etc.) with demographic breakdowns on an annual basis is included as a separate attachment. Also included is the BPD Organization Chart, which details where staff shortages are.

The Police Department is an accredited department, and it is currently undergoing the process of re-accreditation, which they are required to do every 3 years.

Personnel:

The Department is fully budgeted for 135 officers, which is down 4 positions. The 4 positions were budgeted with funds from marijuana mitigation money, but those positions were never filled and have been taken out of the budget going forward. The money for those positions has been reallocated.

The BPD has for many years been actively seeking to increase diversity among officers in the Department. Currently, approximately 36% of the officers are minorities (officers of color). The breakdown is: White (74%); Asian (9%); Hispanic (9%); Black (7%). However, recruitment of any new officers continues to be difficult. Whereas years ago there might be 100 or more applicants taking the Civil Service exam, now that number is closer to 10.

Vacancies:

From Chief Allen's responses to a question regarding vacancies sent to him from the subcommittee-

19 Patrol Officer Vacancies (Approval to hire 9, 4 currently in the academy)

1 Superintendent (Medical Leave)

2 Deputy Superintendents (Traffic and Detective Divisions)

4 Detectives (leaving only 1 Detective)

1 Community Relations

2 Civilian Dispatchers (2 Conditional offers of employment have been sent)

*Officers who have left the Department in the past eighteen months for employment with other Departments 9
Total: 6 white males, 2 Persons of Color, 1 white Female.*

Date	Total number of authorized	Total number of sworn officers	Number below authorized
11/2018	138	130	8
1/2020	139	125	14
3/2022	135	116	19

With regards to vacancies in the department, the department is down 19 positions, up from 9 last year. There are 10 officers who have taken the civil service exam for possible moves to other employment. The Command Staff went from 6 filled positions down to 2. After Acting Chief Allen was promoted, Deputy Paul Cullinane was promoted to Deputy Superintendent. Patrol Deputy, Traffic Deputy and the Detective Deputies positions were all vacant. Currently, Traffic and Detective Deputy positions are still vacant, requiring the two deputy superintendents to take responsibility for two divisions each. Since 2011, 26 officers have left the department for other employment, with a majority leaving within the last 18 months.

More traffic and parking calls come into the department than any other complaint. Not having sufficient staff affects both Police response as well as revenue that comes from parking enforcement, which totals around \$4 million. The shortages in the Detective Division affects cases involving domestic violence, and fraud. With 19 vacancies, overtime (and forced overtime) is necessary to fully staff every 8 hour shift. Staff shortages also meant that other work the department does in the community has been affected, such as meeting with parents of juvenile offenders, elderly services, etc.

Salaries and Retention/Recruitment:

With the current vacancies, forced overtime is necessary to fully staff shifts. Under the present system, this burden falls on newer hires, who have the least seniority. Officers were getting forced to work 16 hour shifts on a regular basis sometimes 3 or 4 times a week.

On a typical school day, minimum manning for the department’s day shift is 12 officers/ 8 hour shift. Due to the vacancies, to achieve this minimum level, officers are forced to work mandatory overtime shifts. The forced overtime hits the officers with the least seniority the hardest. This is one of the key reasons for the low morale in the department. For example, take 2 officers who work the night shift. After completing their overnight shift, they had to cover another shift before going home. One of them was forced to work 16 hour shifts 56 times, or an extra 3 months of work. Another had to work 46 extra 8 hour shifts.

Acting Chief Allen met with the Union and managed to reduce the shortfall of officers by backfilling, essentially taking specialty officers (detectives, etc.) and moving them to patrol. This means that they can’t do part of their own job, which creates additional stresses in various other divisions. This did, however, greatly reduce forced overtime and the newer officers indicated that it made a difference on their morale. This, however, is a temporary fix which will need to be addressed.

Starting salary in Cambridge and Newton is about \$10,000 higher than in Brookline. Patrol officers in Brookline on Step 1 have a base salary of \$56,547; Step 4 (top step) is \$66,308. Cambridge police officers also receive about \$5,000-\$10,000 more in benefits, including the Quinn educational incentive (25% of base pay), which Brookline has replaced with a less favorable educational incentive for newer recruits.

See Appendix- CURRENT WAGE COMPARISONS

*This salary data doesn’t match the public perception that Brookline pays its officers among the highest salaries in the Town when the local newspaper publishes the salary data of Town employees. Two factors contribute to the higher salaries of some police officers: overtime, which the Town does pay; and details, which are paid by private companies (for example, utilities), who are required to hire an officer when doing

construction or utility work in Brookline. The reason that detail pay shows up in the salaries of individual officers is that, unlike other employees who take on additional paid work on their own time, those contractors pay for work details through the Town's MUNIS payroll system. Additionally, the Town (like other municipalities who provide details) receives 10% of each detail payment which goes into the General Fund to support all Town services.

(*this is from last year's (FY22) subcommittee report).

Update on the Public Safety Dispatch Division:

In 2021, there were 66,233 calls for service entered into the Brookline Police Department's computer-aided dispatch system. Of these, 55,269 were police related calls for service, and 10,964 were fire and emergency medical service (EMS) related calls for service. All fire and EMS related calls for service result in a police officer being dispatched along with the fire department and/or ambulance. There are also approximately 130 mental health calls per month.

The Dispatch Division plays a critical role in emergency response, handling not only calls to the Police, but also Fire and ambulance calls. In 2019 only 10 of 15 positions in the Dispatch Center were filled, there was no head dispatcher, and forced overtime caused low morale and resignations. Currently, there are 2 vacancies in this division. In FY23, there were expansion requests for 3 new supervisor dispatch positions (\$14,094), and 1 new Dispatch floater position (\$48,906). The Town Administrator did not approve of the requests, nor did the subcommittee vote on the recommendations. The Chief Dispatcher wrote a memo explaining the need for the new positions-

Below is an excerpt from a memo from the Chief Dispatcher addressing this issue:

From: Darius Varmahmoodi <dvarmahmoodi@brooklinema.gov>

Sent: Monday, March 7, 2022 11:29:55 AM

DS Cullinane,

The dispatch operation will be affected immensely by the rejection of the 3 new shift supervisor positions and the 1 new dispatcher position. The dispatch operation currently operates below minimum staffing levels with a minimum of 3 dispatchers during the daytime, a minimum of 3 dispatchers during the evening shift and a minimum of 2 dispatchers during the overnight shift. The operation handles approximately 80,000 call entries per year between the police department, fire department and emergency medical services....

The daytime shift should operate at 4 to 5 dispatchers, the evening shift with 4 dispatchers and the overnight shift with a minimum of 3 dispatchers. Forced overtime has been ongoing for years in the dispatch operation causing burnout and low morale.

Equipment:

From Chief Allen's responses to a question on the subcommittee's questionnaire-

In 2020 the department purchased 11 cruisers, 7 marked and 4 unmarked. This was the first year in which the hybrid model was available. The 7 marked cruisers, which were operational 24/7 had several mechanical issues and were consistently back at the dealership for repair. This time frame coincided with the COVID pandemic and the dealership experienced significant delays in receiving the necessary parts needed to complete the repairs. This situation caused the Patrol Division to temporarily use cruisers that were assigned to other divisions. Many of these Hybrid cruisers would not pass inspection and needed to be taken out of service.

In 2021 the cruiser budget was cut significantly from 9 to 5 marked cruisers. These cruisers have had significantly less problems than the cruisers bought in 2020

This year the department ordered 5 marked cruisers and they are expected to arrive in the next 4 to 6 weeks. Typically, when new cruisers arrive we trade in the same amount of cruisers to the dealership.

Currently the department has a total of 31 Marked vehicles and 5 motorcycles.

30 Marked Cruisers (15 are Hybrid)

10 of these are 24/7 use vehicles with a much shorter life expectancy and are in that role for no longer than 2 years.

3 of these are K-9 Officers specific vehicles not available for use by others.

5 of the 30 vehicles will be traded in this coming year.

1 Meter Collection Van

A minimum of 14 patrol cruisers are needed for each shift. Most of the time there are 3 to 4 spare cruisers that can be used if necessary. It seems that the initial problems with the 2020 model, combined with the issues caused by the pandemic, are subsiding and there are more available cruisers to be used on a daily basis.

Crime Statistics:

from the Year End Review 2021-

The following is a summary of Part A Crimes reported in Brookline during 2021. Part A crimes are defined by the Federal Bureau of Investigation (FBI) and include: murder, rape, robbery, assault, burglary, larceny and motor vehicle theft.

In 2021, there were 647 Part A crimes reported in Brookline, which is a decrease of 16.84% from the 778 Part A crimes reported in 2020. In addition, there were also 60 attempted Part A crimes reported in 2021 and 10 crimes reported in 2021 that occurred in previous years. As such with the decrease in crime, there was a reduction in the violent crime categories of homicide, robbery, and assaults, as well as in the property crime category of larcenies. Unfortunately, there were increases in rape, burglary, and motor vehicle thefts when compared to 2020. There were no homicides in 2021, which is a decrease from the one homicide that was reported in 2020. There were two rapes in 2021, which is an increase from the one rape in 2020. There were 12 robberies in 2021, which is a decrease from the 15 robberies in 2020. There were 89 assaults in 2021, which is a decrease from the 120 assaults in 2020. There were 54 burglaries in 2021, which is an increase from the 43 burglaries in 2020. There were 468 larcenies in 2021, which is a decrease from the 582 larcenies in 2020. There were 22 motor vehicle thefts in 2021, which is an increase from the 16 motor vehicle thefts in 2020.

During the year, there were 109 arrests, down 47.09% from the 206 arrests made in 2020. The decrease in arrests was partly due to a change in Department operating procedures, where due to the COVID-19 pandemic, officers were encouraged to seek court action rather than place individuals under arrest. This operating procedure went into effect with public health in mind so that in-person contact for extended periods of time could be reduced not only for our officers, but also individuals who would have been subject to arrest.

In 2021, 49 arrestees were identified as white (44.95%), 31 arrestees were identified as black (28.44%), 23 arrestees were identified as Hispanic/Latinx (21.10%), 1 was identified as Asian/Pacific Islander (.92%), 5 were identified as Middle Eastern/East Indian (4.59%), and none were identified as Native American/Alaskan Native. Of the 109 arrests in 2021, 91 identified as males (83.49%) and 18 identified as females (16.51%). Juveniles accounted for two arrests in 2021 (1.83%).

In the area of traffic enforcement, there were 4,358 moving violations issued, which is an increase of 28.18% from the 3,400 issued in 2020. Additionally, there were 76,275 parking violations issued and processed with the Traffic/Parking Division, which is an increase from the 73,271 parking violations issued in 2020.

RECOMMENDATION:

The Public Safety subcommittee strongly believes that there needs to be a discussion in this Town to find ways to improve conditions in the Police Department, from increasing wages and compensation practices that will attract new candidates and retain current officers (which will help reduce overtime), to negotiating contracts with the Police Union that are not retroactive and that don't take years to achieve.

The Public Safety Subcommittee voted unanimously 5-0-0 to recommend an appropriation for FY23 of \$17,703,841 for the Police Department budget.

Janice Kahn, Chair
David-Marc Goldstein
Neil Gordon
Alisa Jonas
Donelle O'Neal, Sr.

APPENDICES:

The Department consists of the following seven subprograms:

1. The **Administration and Support Division** provides overall control of the functions of the Department. It maintains records, provides upgrades in communication and technology equipment and will continue to improve all monitoring and accountability processes to ensure fair and impartial policing takes place. This Division also trains personnel in its uses and distributes weapons and supplies. It also includes the Public Safety Business Office, a group responsible for all financial and budgetary matters for both the Police Department and the Fire Department. Provide oversight and direction in implementing the work and recommendations of the Select Board's Committee on Policing Reforms and the Task Force to Reimagine Policing in Brookline. The Department will review, study and provide feedback to all proposed changes as well as comparisons to current operations. All recommendations that are approved and accepted will be closely monitored to ensure their smooth implementation and successful outcome.
2. The **Patrol Division** continuously patrols all sectors of town while providing a variety of public safety services. Their efforts also serve as a deterrent to criminal activity. The Patrol function is vital and, for that reason, the Chief has directed that there be a minimum staffing policy maintained daily.
3. The **Criminal Investigation Unit** is responsible for the investigation of all violent crimes, including murder, rape, armed robbery, assault, and narcotic violations, and maintains the safety of all evidence.
4. The **Community Relations Division** is charged with facilitating a spirit of cooperation between the public and the Department that helps to enhance the quality of life for all citizens.
5. The **Traffic and Parking Division** is responsible for enforcing all laws and regulations relating to traffic within town.
6. The **Public Safety Dispatch Division** is responsible for handling all police, fire, and ambulance calls, including E-911.
7. One patrol officer functions as the Town's **Animal Control** officer. The Animal Control officer normally works five days a week. All Brookline Police Officers are responsible for enforcing the Town's animal control laws, and will continue to do so when the Animal Control officer is off duty.

CURRENT WAGE COMPARISONS
10 YEAR PATROL OFFICER¹

<u>Municipality</u>	<u>BasePay²</u>	<u>CJ BS Degree</u>	<u>IncentivePay³</u>	<u>TotalPay</u>
Brookline	\$66,309	\$10,000	\$12,895	\$89,204
Boston	\$80,979	\$18,661	\$13,126	\$112,766
Cambridge	\$76,363	\$18,154	\$30,066	\$124,583 ⁴
Newton	\$75,132	\$15,026	\$14,934	\$105,092
State	\$96,364	\$0.00	\$7,968	\$104,332
Average	\$82,210	\$12,960	\$16,524	\$111,693
Average % Brookline Shortfall	19.34%	22.84%	21.96%	20.13%
Average \$ Brookline Shortfall	-\$15,901	-\$2,960	-\$3,629	-\$22,489

1 Covers officers hired after October 1, 2009. Brookline, Boston, and the State Troopers only have available data through FY20. Cambridge settled for a 2.5% across the board increase and a 1.00% hazardous duty increase in FY21 and two 1% across the board increases, a 2.28% hazardous duty increase, and the addition of Juneteenth as a holiday in FY22. Newton has agreed to a 3.00% across the board increase in F21.

2 Refers to top step of pay scale annualized.

3 Includes all other differentials and stipends available to all officers.

4 The current Cambridge CBA extends through FY24. In FY24 the representative Cambridge officer will earn \$135,690.

PERFORMANCE / WORKLOAD INDICATORS

	ACTUAL FY2020	ESTIMATE FY2021	ACTUAL FY2021	ESTIMATE FY2022	ESTIMATE FY 2023
Total Part A Crimes	640	648	758	743	705
Homicide	1	0	1	0	0
Rape	0	3	2	4	4
Robbery	10	8	16	20	14
Assaults	96	118	106	105	115
Breaking and Entering	36	43	57	62	49
Larceny	483	468	557	525	511
Motor Vehicle Theft	14	8	19	27	12
Part A Crime- Clearance Rate	46%	47%	35%	48%	47%
Arrests	282	400	120	200	250
Field Interrogations	1,006	1,600	817	1,100	1,300
Field inquiries/ P.O.I.	38	55	29	40	40
Domestic Violence Investigations	73	105	0	95	0
Crimes Solved through Fingerprint IDs	5	12	0	2	2
Crimes Solved through DNA	0	8	0	0	0
Animal Complaints	773	850	616	800	787
Loud Parties Responded to	164	130	267	315	150
Noise By-Law Violation Tickets issued	0	40	13	20	20
STARS Assignments	15	35	9	25	35
Alcohol Administrative Inspections-Passed	4	15	26	30	30
Alcohol Administrative Inspections- Failed Warnings	16	15	8	10	10
Alcohol Administrative Inspection - Failed TBL Fine	3	5	3	5	5
Alcohol Owner /Management Changes & Investigations	32	35	35	40	40
One & Two Day Licenses/ Permits	69	90	44	50	50
Registered Marijuana Dispensary Inspections	5	7	12	16	16
Registered Marijuana Dispensary	2	4	4	4	4
Rooming Houses Inspected	50	50	45	50	50
Licenses to Carry Firearms Issued/Renewed	117	110	172	150	150
Firearms Identification Cards (FID)	29	20	21	20	20
Fingerprints Taken for Community Members	103	250	30	250	250
Town Counsel Investigations	48	50	50	50	50
Police-related Calls	59,611	69,000	52,978	57,000	59,000
Self-Initiated Police Calls	30,622	27,000	23,541	27,000	28,000
Fire-related Calls	5,926	8,600	7,862	9,800	9,800
Medical Calls	3,970	4,750	4,416	4,800	5,000
E-911 Calls	18,552	18,000	15,172	26,500	27,000

PERFORMANCE / WORKLOAD INDICATORS (con't)

	ACTUAL FY2020	ESTIMATE FY2021	ACTUAL FY2021	ESTIMATE FY2022	ESTIMATE FY 2023
Facebook Followers	4,672	4,800	5,047	5,200	5,400
Twitter Followers	10,914	11,000	10,899	11,200	11,400
Website Hits	157,555	80,000	82,300	90,000	90,000
Instagram followers	2,088	2,200	2,350	2,500	2,700
Students in AWARE	1,761	1,750	105	250	250
Citizen Police Academy Graduates	0	30	41	40	40
Women Participating in RAD Classes	0	150	39	150	150
Child Seats Inspected	180	175	154	270	300
Taxi Vehicles Inspections	0	25	0	20	20
Hackney Licenses Issued	0	50	0	40	40
Parking Tickets Issued	88,597	105,000	89,115	90,000	90,000
Collection Rate In-State (CY)		85%			
Collection Rate Out-Of-State (CY)		62%			
Parking Tickets Paid Online	43,932	50,000	50,308	45,000	60,000
Parking Tickets Appealed Online	6,435	8,000	10,925	7,000	9,000
Moving Violations	8,051	10,000	2,945	10,000	6,000
Parking Ticket Hearings	9,034	12,500	11,772	12,500	13,000
Detail Collection Rate:					
0 < 30 Days	60%	20%	41%	20%	30%
31 < 60 Days	80%	75%	79%	75%	80%
61 < 90 Days	94%	90%	96%	90%	95%
91 < 105 Days	96%	95%	98%	95%	98%
106 < 115 Days	98%	99%	99%	99%	99%
Bicycle Enforcement	87	75	7	75	10
Grants Awarded:					
Police	\$662,200	\$541,855	\$598,587	\$534,433	\$534,433
Urban Areas Security Initiatives (UASI) (Funding for Multiple Town Agencies)	\$373,720	\$350,000	\$447,447	\$447,447	\$447,447
Emergency Management:					
Citizens trained for CERT (Community Emergency Response Team)	0	30	30	25	30
CERT Activations (shelters, flu clinics, storm drill, etc.)	40	10	75	100	50
Community education programs on emergency preparedness	18	15	8	15	15
Emergency Operation Center (EOC) Activations	7	5	200	75	10