

**Town of Brookline  
Advisory Committee Minutes  
Thursday, March 16, 2023**

**Meeting Recording:**

[https://brooklinema.zoomgov.com/rec/share/DJOR0IrUsbHGkbPGfJDGhfr\\_bBY0itFOxEv5ZKMWJvtQE8qz mhTu\\_BtEkv4wSwI.WTHB9yL4GwFZVRnl](https://brooklinema.zoomgov.com/rec/share/DJOR0IrUsbHGkbPGfJDGhfr_bBY0itFOxEv5ZKMWJvtQE8qz mhTu_BtEkv4wSwI.WTHB9yL4GwFZVRnl)

---

**Present:** Ben Birnbaum, Harry Bohrs, Clifford Brown, Patricia Correa, John Doggett, Dennis Doughty, Katherine Florio, Harry Friedman, David-Marc Goldstein, Neil Gordon, Susan Granoff, Kelly Hardebeck, Amy Hummel, Anita Johnson, Alisa Jonas, Janice Kahn, Pamela Lodish, Joslin Murphy, Donelle O'Neal, Linda Olson Pehlke, Markus L. Penzel, Stephen Reeders, Carlos Ridruejo, Lee Selwyn, Carolyn R. Thall, Christine Westphal

**Absent:** Carol Levin, David Pollak, Alok Somani

**Also Attending:** Acting Police Chief Jennifer Paster, Deputy Town Administrator for Policy and Fiscal Affairs Melissa Goff, Public Safety Business Office Finance Manager Michael D'Onofrio, BPD Union President Detective Michael Keaveney, BPD Superintendent Kevin Mealy, Lee Bolman, Paul Campbell, Joan Gallos, Gene Deutsch, Eva Balash-Deutsch, and other members of the public.

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 PM.

**Announcements:** Pursuant to this Board's Authority under 940 CMR 29.10 (8), all committee members will be participating remotely via telephone or video conferencing due to emergency regulations regarding the Corona virus. The Chair has reviewed the requirements of the regulations. There is a quorum physically present and all votes taken will be recorded by roll call so all above listed Advisory Committee members will be allowed to vote.

**7:00 PM          Public Comments**

Carolyn Thall - So my comment is one that I've now made a few times, and I just really have to say I am frustrated as an Advisory Committee member, as a Town meeting member representing Precinct 16, at the lack of basic bottom line information. The Advisory Committee, and at this point even the public, has been provided about the debt exclusion question, which I know has not technically been placed on the ballot. And yet I think there are some sort of rough contour numbers, questions about the MSBA reimbursement, what that process is, what the taxpayer ask is going to be, what happens if the project goes over budget? What is the process by which Town Meeting can authorize more borrowing? What is the Town's obligation to inform taxpayers about increased borrowing when borrowing number changes? How many times can that happen? I was thinking and hoping that there would be some kind of conversation, at least in this body about this really, really, really big amount of money. We're hearing very long conversations about much smaller amounts of money, for example, at the Select Board hearing on Tuesday. Maybe I'm just naive, and because I'm new to this but I was hoping for more. And again, that's not about the impact which I know take a little bit more time to calculate, but just about the contours, and what are we talking about here? Thanks.

Joan Gallos - Good evening. I'm here to praise the Town for the extraordinary and well researched planning in the Washington Street Complete Street Project. I am also here to question why, in God's name, did it leave out .1 mile of Washington Street, one of the busiest sections, narrowest sections, a section where we have already had a death from a car injury, and where there have been many misses. That area, called Upper Washington, which goes from Beacon to

the Boston line, becomes busier and busier in the year to come. The new Driscoll school opens in September with the school now fronting on Washington at the corner of Beacon, not quiet little Westbourne Terrace. We also have the opening of new retail, and that large Brookliner apartment building right on the Brookline Boston border. That will add 300 units, 300 units filled with people who will be walking, biking, crossing, and traveling on Washington Street. I'm really here to ask the Town to augment that project, to take advantage of planning that has already fabulously been done, to see how it can be implemented in that .1 mile area of Washington Street, finish the job and do it in a way that is economically beneficial to the Town. The planning's already been done. It is in process. Money has already been secured for the whole rest of Washington Street. So we're really talking the Town providing funding for a very small area and when there are contractors being bid, it will be much cheaper to continue a bike lane, to look at curbing, to look at lighting, to look at all the proposed changes for the rest of Washington Street. It will be much cheaper to add that little section of Washington and be done. Right now there are no bike lanes. There is inconsistent lighting. There are strange historic build outs which cause people to both speed down Washington, and then scoot out into the other lane. So I am asking the Town to please consider that project, and to figure out now how to get into this project which is already well down the line. Thank you.

Vice Chair Friedman invited Joan to attend the Advisory Committee meeting on March 23<sup>rd</sup> when the DPW budget will be reviewed and she can share her comments and concerns then, as well.

Lee Bowman - I'm on the same agenda item that Joan Gallos is, and want to endorse everything that she said, and also, I'm aligned with one of the comments Carolyn Thall made about public information. As the neighborhood just north of Beacon on Washington has become increasingly concerned as we've seen the Driscoll progressing we're seeing the other development that's going up there, and very much worried that a bad situation will get worse. I was just randomly casting about on the Internet trying to find ideas and options, and I came across this magnificent plan for Washington Street, and I thought, Gee! Does anybody know about this? I talked to neighbors, everybody I talked to said no, nobody knew about it, and in addition nobody could quite understand why did it stop at Beacon Street? It's not very much farther to the Brighton line. Why are we going to do this? What we think will be an enormous upgrade and improvement to Washington Street and make it much friendlier for pedestrians, for bicycles, for other modes of transportation in addition to automobiles and here, in as best we can tell, part of why it didn't happen was that decision making around the Driscoll and decision making around the roads were in 2 different pots, different people in different places were making those decisions. There wasn't any coordination between those 2 pieces. I'll join Joan Gallos for the meeting on the 23<sup>rd</sup> as well, because the neighborhood is very concerned about what's happening on Washington Street. Thank you very much for your attention.

## **Public Hearing**

### **Review, discussion and possible vote on FY 24 Police Department CIP requests**

Carlos Ridruejo noted that there are 2 items on the CIP for Public Safety described below:

#### **RADIO INFRASTRUCTURE**

The upgrading of the radio infrastructure for the police and fire radio channels will need to be addressed, including the radio copper circuits connections as they will no longer be supported by Verizon. Police channel 1, and Fire channel 1 have not been upgraded for the last 20 to 25 years, Police channel 2 was built out about 13 years ago. According to the Federal Communications Commission (FCC) the typical life of radio equipment is 7 to 10 years; in reality radio systems

are good for 12 to 15 years. Either way, we are overdue for infrastructure upgrade to our radio systems. Currently, the majority of our radio infrastructure, is considered by Motorola to be, "end of life" and "end of service," since parts do not readily exist for this equipment.

We have not been able to do any upgrades or improvements on the core equipment since the FCC has a freeze on T-Band radio frequencies, which Brookline Police and Fire operate on. The T-Band frequencies operate in the 470-512 MHz band. The thought was the FCC was going to auction off the T-Band frequencies to private carriers, then replace and pay for the radio systems that operated in the T-Band spectrum. This has not happened, and the FCC has found that no wireless carrier is interested in bidding on this spectrum. Congress will have to rule within the next year to eliminate the auction of T-Band, so public safety agencies can move forward with their systems.

The project will consist of replacing Police channels 1 and 2, Fire channel 1 along with the subscriber radios (Portable and Mobile radios) for both departments.

Working with Motorola the estimated cost to build out these 3 radio channels infrastructure along with the subscriber costs is \$3,944,577.30.

The break down provided by Motorola is:

Police = \$1,690,437.45 (Police Infrastructure — 2 radio channels = \$672,225.75; Police Subscribers = \$1,018,211.70)  
Fire = \$937,953.25 (Fire Infrastructure = \$388,486.35; Fire Subscribers = \$549,466.90)  
Shared Costs Total = \$1,316,166.60

The Town plans to lease-finance the cost of this project over a 5-year period with an estimated lease payment of \$900,000 per year.

**TOTAL \$900,000**

### **BODY WORN AND IN-CAR CAMERA EQUIPMENT**

The Brookline Police Department has been in contact with vendors with the goal of researching initial costs and additional fiduciary impacts with regard to the Department-wide implementation of Body-Worn (BWC) and In-Car (ICC) Camera Systems. This equipment will allow our Department to meet our goals of increased employee accountability and improved public trust, and will meet the public's demand for greater transparency with regard to police involved incidents, community member complaints and internal investigations.

After years of research and meetings with vendors, our IT Division and Command Staff are exploring an integrated system which combines body cameras, cruiser cameras, information storage, and replacement/upgrade of both equipment and software. The cost of a full implementation of the system including bodycams, cruiser cameras, digital storage and scheduled equipment replacement, is approximately \$200,000 for the first year, with approximate costs of \$150,000 each following year over a five-year contract which will include all necessary equipment, training, storage, and maintenance.

**TOTAL \$200,000**

### **Comments, Questions, Discussion**

Harry Bohrs Q: Are these Radio Systems running off of cellular service? A: No.

Q: Any difficulty with transmission in hilly sections of Brookline? A: Can find that out, but not aware of any, just some difficulty in certain buildings.

Acting Chief Paster answered that most are on the same page wanting cameras, but it is an item that is still part of collective bargaining and something we are working towards.

David-Marc Goldstein asked should we be buying it before we have an agreement to use it? If not going to be in next contract should we wait? A: Melissa Goff noted funding will stay in the special appropriation and will be available when ready to make the purchase.

**7:30 PM      Public Meeting**

**Review, discussion and possible vote on FY 24 Police Department CIP requests**

A **MOTION** was made and seconded for Favorable Action on Public Safety CIP Item 1: Radio Infrastructure \$900,000. By a **VOTE** of 23 in favor, none opposed and no abstentions, the Advisory Committee voted Favorable Action on the Public

A **MOTION** was made and seconded for Favorable Action on Public Safety CIP Item 2: Body and in Car Cameras \$200,000. By a **VOTE** of 23 in favor, none opposed and no abstentions, the Advisory Committee voted Favorable Action on Item 2 of the Public Safety CIP.

**Report from the Public Safety Subcommittee, Discussion and Possible Vote on FY 24 Police Department Operating Budget**

Alisa Jonas, a member of the Subcommittee gave the report on the budget hearing on the Police Department Operating FY24 budget a copy of which is linked below.

For the base budget (without the override), the subcommittee unanimously recommends favorable action on the Police Department budget request of \$17,609,095, amended by the subcommittee to include an additional \$144,000 in the Salaries line item to reinstate the two Patrol Officer positions that were eliminated as part of the requested base budget, plus an additional \$40,000 in the Education/Training/Conferences line item to bring that appropriation back to the amount that had been expended under that line item in FY22. Both amendments passed the subcommittee unanimously.

These two additions result in the recommendation of \$17,793,095 for the base police budget.

The amount recommended by the subcommittee for the police budget if the override were to pass is for the same amount as the subcommittee's amended base budget recommendation of \$17,793,095, which includes the disparity between the base budget and the override budget due to the reinstatement of the two Patrol Officer positions in the override budget, and the \$40,000 restoration for training, which is not in the Town Administrator's recommendation.

For further details on the Police Department budget as presented in the Financial Plan, see Section 4I, pages 51-66 of the Brookline FY-2024 Financial Plan, and online at <https://stories.opengov.com/brooklinema/published/Bt6-Dad5FJ>

Acting Chief Paster shared a PowerPoint Slide (linked to these minutes) that showed the organization of the Police Department. She discussed Community Policing and vacancies within the department's 4 divisions.

The Police Department is divided into four sections. The Patrol division is the main division. Those are the men and women in uniform who answer the 911 calls. We have a Detective division who investigates crime. They're in charge of follow-ups and also responding to scenes for crime scene processing, and a myriad of other things. Community Policing is the division that is responsible for public information, things like social media, for example. The Community Affairs Officer works out of that division. There are 3 Youth Resource Officers, one who is assigned to high school age children and two who split the younger set, 8th grade and below. Donald Kerrigan and Officer Katie and her canine partner, Bear. The fourth division is the Traffic Division. The Department is currently authorized for 134 officers. However, it is 25 below that right now at 109, with 5 out on long-term injuries unlikely to come back and an additional 3 that are out injured but expected to return in the next few months.

Those vacancies are spread the best they can spread them throughout the four divisions. Each of the patrol shifts is short. The first platoon, which is the day shift, is short by 7 officers, second, platoon by 4, the third platoon, the overnight shift by 6. The Department has taken a step it never wanted to take, which is reducing the number of officers on the street across the board by one per shift. Acting Chief Paster said she hopes that they don't have to go below that, because to her it becomes an officer safety issue.

In order to meet minimum staffing levels, the Department offers overtime across all divisions to officers who want to come in and work those shifts, and if they can't be filled on a voluntary basis, then they are in a force situation, and officers who come into work 8 hours are likely to work 16, and hopefully not 24, although it has happened.

Typically, the way vacancies in other divisions occur is somebody either asks to go back to patrol. That's pretty rare in the Detective division where you see 3 vacancies. Those are 3 detectives who moved laterally to other police departments and we had to make the decision not to fill those jobs. This compounds the morale issue because if you're a young, or if you're an officer in patrol, and you aspire to be a detective someday, it's frustrating to see that there are openings, and it's not something that we can offer you right now, just because we're so short-staffed. It is the same for Traffic. We have officers who are very interested in working traffic assignments. Traffic is probably the biggest concern that we have in Town when it comes to enforcement, accident investigations, and the like. We are short two officers in the Traffic division and in the Community Service division. The officers that had been assigned to the BHA Properties formerly known as Walk and Talk. When those two officers left we elected not to replace them in there. It is a little bit of robbing Peter to pay Paul.

Acting Chief Paster said the Department is doing the best it can by playing this chess game with its employees.

Chair Doughty asked if Michael had anything to add on the on the budget side.

Michael D'Onofrio replied: No, everything was well presented. I think we did a five-year analysis since 2020. I think that you know we talked about not only being level funded but with the effect inflation might have on replacing things like vehicles. We've gone from gasoline primarily-driven vehicles to hybrid vehicles and there's about a thirty percent increase in the cost of those. Our ability to replace those has shrunk as our budget has been level funded. Training costs are clearly up, even though we're doing things on Zoom. The costs have gone up fifty, sixty percent on that we continue to receive grant funding for a lot of this stuff, so we're trying hard to not impact the operating budget, however it's been a hard slog for the last few years.

## Comments, Questions, Discussion

Harry Bohrs Q: Why has spending on training gone down? Regarding pay levels and neighboring communities is driven by the fact that we are no longer part of Quinn. Does that account for some of the delta? What does that mean for the dynamic between officers that are grandfathered in the Quinn system and those not? Is this being dealt with in collective bargaining? What was the subcommittee's thinking in adding back 2 positions and does it get us anything?

A: Janice said that in the last year 2 lateral transfers out of the department have returned. Hoping to fill open positions with lateral transfers once the department becomes more stabilized. It makes sense to hold onto those positions.

Melissa Goff explained that the training reduction was done during COVID across all departments to meet reduction in revenue and we haven't been able to restore all departments. Eventually we want to get back to this but bringing back FTEs we lost is the priority and training is at the end of the list right now.

Regarding Quinn is a big piece of the disparity we are seeing in communities. We have in the collective bargaining a number for a contract and went above and beyond but we don't know where an arbitrator will land. Part of that exchange is to reduce these two vacancies to cover the overage.

For more information see the document about comparable salaries attached to these minutes.

Joslin Murphy commented that Mike D'Onofrio was a great asset for the Police Department. She further clarified that the department contractually has 48 hours of training. That training money is funded in the personnel budget that hasn't been touched. Also did the subcommittee move to include the 2 patrol positions and training money in the base budget? A: Yes, and we would do the same, present them as separate amendments.

Susan Granoff asked about Pedestrian Traffic Regulations currently before the Transportation Board, a set of regulations left by Todd Kirrane before he left and their enforcement. Are these enforceable? Do you have officers who have the time to do that and how? A: The Acting Chief suggested that Mike Murphy, Head of the Traffic Division may be familiar with this and she will follow up as necessary.

Ben Birnbaum had 3 questions related to personnel. One of the things he noted on the organizational chart is that nearly 40% of the detective force is gone. What kind of an impact does it have? Also, he said he is delighted to hear about the social worker, and that everybody's pleased with this person's work. Can you explain how a social worker is employed in police work. Do they sit by the phone waiting to be called by Patrol saying, "We have this kind of thing and we can use your help." Lastly, the 25 vacant positions seem unusual. From the perspective of a Police Chief, can you explain how this could happen?

Chief Paster responded regarding the effects of the Detective division being short-staffed and gave an example of when she was a detective 15 years ago. Then there was a routine where everybody would come in every day. They would look over the reports from the previous shift. The Sergeant would assign out cases and they would get to them right away. Immediately call a victim and follow up on that case. The expectation was that if it was a case that was solvable, and there's a set of criteria that make something solvable, they would get right on it, work with the partner if necessary, and try to resolve it – summons, or arrest, whatever.

Now that the case loads are much bigger, a victim might not get a call back the same day. The detective might have 2 or 3 days of backlog waiting for them. So, they're doing the best work they can do but it's taking a lot longer. The quality of service that our community has become accustomed to is suffering.

What's missing is the proactive work that the Department used to be out there doing, like acting on drug tips, acting on Internet crime, etc. Things that are more proactive and officer initiated, those kinds of cases pay the price because they just don't have the free time to go out and sort of dig stuff up and do the investigative work that most of us like to do.

Chief Paster responded to the second question regarding the social worker and what that might look like.

The Department currently has an LCISW, licensed independent clinical social worker, who is amazing. Her role is not to be a true co-responder at this time. She has an office at the station so people can walk in and meet with her. Typically, she follows up on cases such as a family disturbance situation. It's a family that's in crisis. They're in need of support. If anybody has tried to find a therapist for themselves, their parent, or a child, there are waiting lists for months and months. The social worker is able to bridge those gaps between the time that Brookline officers are being called to the time when a more appropriate level of care can be provided. She's not responding to as many crises, or as many 911 calls. She does on occasion, but it's mostly the follow up work. What the Department would like to do with additional clinicians is have a true CoResponse model where there is an officer on each shift that rides in the car with the clinician in response to 911 calls. This is being done in many other communities now in the surrounding cities and towns where the clinician will wait in the car until the scene is deemed safe by the officer. Then they would be invited in to practice de-escalation. Get somebody regulated to the point that they can engage in meaningful conversation. Do an intake on scene and figure out next steps. It's easy for a police officer to show up, find somebody in crisis, and leave somebody where they are, send them to the hospital, or arrest them. The Department is trying to do a little bit better than that, and not overburden the system, keep people out of the criminal justice system who shouldn't be there and get people the help that they need.

Q: How rare is the 25 vacancies? Is it Brookline or nationwide? A: It is both There definitely is a shortage of people that want to do this job for a number of different reasons. It's off hours. It's not pretty. It can be some hard-gritty work at times. She suggested that most of the department didn't sign up to do this job for the money. However, if you want to do this work and you're looking around at people that are doing similar work and getting paid or compensated at much higher rates, people will go elsewhere. Gone are the days where people are loyal to a specific city or town.

The Acting Chief noted that she grew up in Brookline and she's loyal to Brookline. She wants to work here. She cares about this community specifically, but they are seeing fewer and fewer applicants come up through civil service who have their residency preference, and they're doing the job because they want to do the job and not because they're tied specifically to profile. So, if the money and the benefits are better then they'll jump.25 below where we should be need to act on this and figure out how to make it right.

Joslin Murphy shared two personal/professional experiences she had with social workers and the police department to emphasize how important these positions are. I grew up in Brookline and one of the greatest attributes we have here is Public Safety. These are really important positions and I hope you will support them.

Alisa Jonas believes there may have been an error in the subcommittee's calculations. \$140K doesn't reflect the cost of the patrol officers. Not sure she wants to support the two positions for this year given the number of vacancies and 5 people retiring. Confused about charts on the salaries.

Acting Chief Paster responded that she never wants to see positions cut but she is not optimistic about the likelihood of getting 25 cops in place by the end of next year. The more officers we have to fill patrol shifts we can realize the benefits in different buckets. Once we have more officers in patrol we can offer more opportunities for movement within the department.

Neil Gordon added difference between budget and organization chart. How many officers on the street – there needs to be a correlation between the positions on the chart and the funding for those positions. The number of officers on the street matters, the more vacant positions we have showing the more we should support the department to fill them. The dependent variable in public safety is public safety, you start cutting back and the ratio of crimes to criminals is not one to one. This is not the place to make cuts. It sends an important budget message.

Janice Kahn noted that this department has already had cuts in patrol officers. No time to cut more especially since our town is growing. Would like clarity on the number of positions. She asked if one patrol officer position is being swapped for a social worker? Top number 134 instead of 135?

A: The Acting Chief responded that a year ago, we were 135. The union agreed to give up one position to fill with a civilian crime analyst. When we onboard the social worker, the union will do the same thing so that will bring us to 133.

Carolyn Thall asked Mike to explain challenges of capital budget and purchasing vehicles. Is the initiative to purchase hybrid vehicles by a mandate the Town Meeting did or something the Department wants to do? If you could fully fund the Capital Line item, what would that look like? What is it costing the Town to go green?

Michael D'Onofrio could not speak to a mandate so Melissa Goff explained that while there is no formal mandate in the bylaw there have been sufficient discussions with ZEAB regarding the climate goals of the Town that strongly suggest that departments go electric. We talk about the fact these mandates will cause a deterioration in our fleet because we don't have the funds to keep up with maintenance costs although we are assured there will eventually be a cost savings.

Michael added that what we are finding is if you drag out the replacement cycle there are problems with the equipment whether cars or IT. Patrol cars and vehicles used in community service and the challenge of having a smaller fleet along with cars that are in the shop drive that. But if you are already spending \$68K on a car rather than \$45K you can't keep the same footprint. We have 6 vehicles on back order so supply chain challenges as well and contribute to the shortfall.

Patty Correa questions were answered about putting two positions back but still struggling with it. How would you use proposed increase to the training budget? A: Would like to see it distributed for command staff training – professional development and leadership trainings and the other piece is difference in training from what we had pre-COVID to what we have now. Academy training – how to use all the things we have on our belt and needs to be hands on and interactive. Need scenario-based training, live and interactive. Get away from online and have people come in or we send officers out to get this.

Q: To what extent is done now in house? A: We do our own in-service training. We contract out to the Municipal Police Training Council that sets out a curriculum for 48 hours of training and the Department is bound by that. They offer several train-the-trainer courses for the mandatory subjects that will be taught each year. For our training division we have officers in-house who are our firearms instructor, our defensive tactics instructors. They're ready to go, and they can teach those subjects. Then they have an additional set of hours that can be used to address community needs as necessary, domestic violence, for example. That's something that they would like to have the flexibility to either have



consultants come in and teach on those subjects or send officers to classes that are being held in any of the other sites. Those are the sort of things that are covered in the training budget that are above and beyond the in service line.

Pam Lodish Q: With cuts in Police Department how many injuries have to do because of insufficient staff? A: Difficult to make a correct correlation. Many back injuries. Trying ways to minimize effects of wearing the heavy equipment on a police belt day-to-day.

Q: Anything we could do with the budget to help with this? A: Everything goes back to staffing and training.

Carlos Ridruejo commented on the discussion about fossil fuel direction to use less and noted that we have to consider how it effects different departments and the accompanying costs and impacts. How do we not burden the departments themselves unfairly because this is an unofficial Town mandate but distribute the burden throughout all of the budget? Perhaps a green fund that help subsidize department's efforts. He further wished Acting Chief Paster success and thinks she deserves this position because she knows the Town so well.

Melissa Goff added that there are many departments struggling to find vehicles that are electric and the consequences are more pressing then the benefits but advocates will tell you it is a climate crisis and there is an urgency to this. Not all equipment is readily available as hybrid or fully electric such as certain fire trucks and heavy vehicles.

Marc Penzel asked about funds added back into the base budget – if it is hard to fill police officer positions, it may be easier to fill social worker positions, would there be any reason you couldn't use the add back funds to hire social workers? A: Aware of grant funding opportunities through the Department of Mental Health and there is a separate application in the pipeline that could provide another crisis co-responder. Only open to Police Departments. My concern to ask for money for social workers the community might ask why going to Police and not some other Town department like mental health or the schools.

Q: Could you use the money for social workers? Grants are not long term, they come and go and I know it worked out that current social worker started as a grant and is now being hired full time. Switching one for one keeps numbers in the department. A: I think it can be done but I shared my concerns that it will be flagged by another interest group who will want the money.

Janice Kahn noted that there is another initiative that they are looking across the Town at where social workers are and this isn't the moment to be making the request while this is still being worked out Town-wide as to how we want it to look like. Good ideas but not good timing. I believe we need to not cut positions, as they don't miraculously come back. Whether money is turned back at the end of the year is less important that giving the department the funds they need to serve the community. This department needs to have that fiscal flexibility and urge the AC to support restoring those positions. And I also support our Acting Chief and the job she is doing.

A **MOTION** was made and seconded for Favorable Action on the Police Department FY24 base budget of \$17,609,095

An **AMENDMENT** was made and seconded for Favorable Action to add \$40,000 to the base budget for training. By a **VOTE** of 21 in favor, none opposed and 4 abstentions, the AMENDMENT passed.

An **AMENDMENT** was made and seconded for Favorable Action to add additional \$144,404 in the Salaries line item to reinstate the two Patrol Officer positions that were eliminated. By a **VOTE** of 20 in favor, none opposed and 5 abstentions the AMENDMENT passed.

A **MOTION** was made and seconded for Favorable Action on the amended Police Department FY24 base budget of \$ \$17,793,499.

By a **VOTE** of 23 in favor, none opposed and 2 abstentions the Advisory Committee recommended Favorable Action on the amended Police Department FY24 base budget of \$ \$17,793,499.

Cliff Brown noted that if there is an override there are more funds that are usually available and that is different then if there isn't an override. Don't we have a number for the override budget? In the event of an override I would support this budget rather than abstain.

There was a discussion about whether or not to take a vote that envisions an override in keeping with what we have been doing with previous budgets.

Q: Is the Select Board contemplating separate numbers for Schools and the Town? A: Not separately voted. There will be an explanation that is mailed to voters but will not be on the ballot. The Select Board will be made by the 21<sup>st</sup>.

A **MOTION** was made and seconded that in the event of a successful override the Advisory Committee recommends a FY24 Police Department Operating budget of \$17,793,499.

By a **VOTE** of 24 in favor, 1 opposed and no abstentions the Advisory Committee recommends Favorable Action

The Chair thanked Acting Chief Paster, Melissa Goff and others for joining.

#### **8:45 pm Other Business**

There was discussion about Carolyn Thall's comments earlier in the evening and suggested next steps.

Upon a **MOTION** made and seconded to adjourn, and voted unanimously, the meeting was adjourned at 9:34 p.m.

#### **Documents Presented**

<https://www.brooklinema.gov/DocumentCenter/Index/3908>

- Brookline Police Department Power Point March 2023 Updated
- Police Salary Comparables
- Public Safety Subcommittee Questions on BPD FY 24 Operating Budget
- BPD Annual Year End Report - Department - 2022
- 2023 03 13 Public Safety Subcommittee Report FY24 Police Budget

VOTES

Vote Tally Sheet - 03/16/2023							
	Vote 1	Vote 2	Vote 3	Vote 4	Vote 5	Vote 6	Vote 7
# Votes Yes	23	23	0	21	20	23	24
# Votes No	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
# Votes Abstain	0	0	0	4	5	2	0
Vote Description:	<b>MAIN MOTION: FAVORABLE ACTION on \$900,000 for Public Safety CIP Item: RADIO INFRASTRUCTURE</b>	<b>MAIN MOTION: FAVORABLE ACTION on \$200,000 for Public Safety CIP Item: BODY WORN + IN-CAR CAMERAS</b>	<b>MAIN MOTION: FAVORABLE ACTION on FY24 'base' Operating Budget for Police Department of \$17,609,095</b>	<b>Subcommittee AMENDMENT: Add \$40,000 to the Police Department FY24 Operating Budget for Education /Training /Conferences</b>	<b>Subcommittee AMENDMENT: Add \$144,404 to the Police Department FY24 Operating Budget for Salaries (reinstate 2 Patrol Officer positions)</b>	<b>MAIN MOTION: FAVORABLE ACTION on amended FY24 'base' Operating Budget for Police Department of \$17,793,499</b>	<b>MAIN MOTION: In the event of a successful override, an FY24 Police Department Operating Budget recommendation of \$17,793,499</b>
	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>	<i>Enter Y, N or A</i>
Ben Birnbaum	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Harry Bohrs	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Cliff Brown	Y	Y		A	A	A	Y
Patty Correa	Y	Y		A	A	A	Y
John Doggett	Y	Y		Y	A	Y	Y
Katherine Florio	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Harry Friedman	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	N
David-Marc Goldstein	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Neil Gordon	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Susan Granoff	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Kelly Hardebeck	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Amy Hummel				A	A	Y	Y
Anita Johnson	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Alisa Jonas	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Janice Kahn	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
Carol Levin							

<b>Pam Lodish</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Joslin Murphy</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Donelle O'Neal, Sr.</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Linda Olson Pehlke</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Markus Penzel</b>	Y	Y		Y	A	Y	Y
<b>David Pollak</b>							
<b>Stephen Reeders</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Carlos Ridruejo</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Lee Selwyn</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Alok Somani</b>							
<b>Carolyn Thall</b>	Y	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Christine Westphal</b>				A	Y	Y	Y
<b>Dennis Doughty</b>							