

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

Brookline Preservation Commission
MINUTES OF THE May 11, 2021 MEETING
Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software

Commissioners Present:

Elton Elperin, Chair
David King
John Spiers
David Jack
Elizabeth Armstrong
Peter Kleiner
Jim Batchelor

Commissioners Absent:

Richard Panciera, Vice Chair
Wendy Ecker

Elton Elperin – asks John Spiers and Elizabeth Armstrong to vote for Mr. Panciera and Ms. Ecker respectively.

Staff: Valerie Birmingham, Tina McCarthy

Mr. Elperin called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Approval of Minutes

No minutes.

Public Comment

PUBLIC HEARINGS – DEMOLITION

314 Clark Road – Application for the demolition of the house and detached garage (Mels-Brookline LLC, applicant). **Precinct 12**

Monte French – architect, no comment

Thomas Reed – house to right of 314 Clark Road reads comments from Steve Silverman (54 Cotswold Road)

Charles Baker – 179 Clinton Road backyard abutters, Real Estate lawyer. Wants to preserve trees. Talk to neighbors.

Elyse Cherry – abutter to rear wrote letter. Early subdivision requirement deed restriction. Also wants to keep trees. Also, use to be a Real Estate lawyer.

Rupa Cornell – 305 Clark Road, across street, just moved in after gut renovation. Want to see plans.

Jill Janows – 189 Clinton Road – abutters to rear. Also loves the trees.

48
49 Amy Hummel – resident Clark Road, not abutter, agrees with significance.
50
51 David Jack – agree with abutters, significant.
52
53 Elton Elperin – elegant siting, beautiful.
54
55 Peter Kleiner – pretty clear from neighbors statements.
56
57 Elton Elperin – motion significant for House and Garage. Peter Kleiner second.
58
59 David King – yes, Jim Batchelor – yes, David Jack – yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Elton Elperin
60 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes, Jim Batchelor - yes
61

62
63

PUBLIC HEARINGS – LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

64

65 **14 Glen Road (Pill Hill LHD)** –Continuation - Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to
66 alter the rear fenestration by closing in and adding windows, construct new rear bay extension and
67 enclose rear entry porch. (Osborn Studio+, applicant). **Precinct 5**

68

69 Valerie Birmingham presents.

70

71 Lynn Osborn – No real comments

72

73 David Jack – subcommittee reached agreement about detailing of bay.

74

75 Peter Kleiner – confirmed dimensional requirements. Motion to approve as submitted. Elton Elperin
76 second.

77

78 David King – yes, Jim Batchelor – yes, David Jack – yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Elton Elperin
79 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes, John Spiers- yes

80

81

82 **138 High Street (Pill Hill LHD)** –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install an electric
83 car charger and lighting on a detached shed (Michael Els, applicant). **Precinct 5**

84

85 Valerie Birmingham presents

86

87 Michael Els – no comment

88

89 David King – timer or motion detector?

90

91 Valerie Birmingham – motion.

92

93 Michael Els – 2-5 minutes on

94

95 Elton Elperin – would like a shielded lamp. Hood covers bulb should prevent views of bulb.

96
97 Michael Els – yes agree, found some. But many have these and my house does. Happy to have
98 shielding.
99
100 Peter Kleiner – only just started reviewing light fixtures.
101
102 Jim Batchelor – great, thank you.
103
104 Elton Elperin – fine with exposed Tesla device
105
106 Jim Batchelor – agrees.
107
108 Jim Batchelor – motion accept with shielded light, review by staff. Elton Elperin second.
109 All vote in favor
110
111
112 **132 Naples Road (Graffam McKay LHD)** –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to
113 install a fence enclosing the left side yard and install 3 condensers behind the fence (Woods
114 Remodeling & Service Inc., applicant). **Precinct 8**
115
116 Tina McCarthy presents.
117
118 Rachel Meagher – no comment
119
120 Jim Batchelor – nice fence. Ok for screening
121
122 Elton Elperin – odd for fence to make right angle at condensers. Want condenser fence to be simpler.
123
124 Jim Batchelor – like 1 type of screening
125
126 Rachel Meagher – shows big bush, says you can’t see it
127
128 David King – agree with Jim, 1 kind
129
130 Jim Batchelor – motion accept as submitted. David Jack second.
131 All vote in favor.
132
133
134 **53 Powell Street (Cottage Farm LHD)** –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish
135 the detached garage in the northeast corner of the property and construct a new two car detached
136 garage in the southeast corner of the property (LDA Architecture & Interiors, LLP, applicant).
137 **Precinct 1**
138
139 Valerie Birmingham – present case. Town Counsel says garage is reviewable. Demo, initial
140 significant hearing tonight.
141

142 Bob Allen – represent case. This is the right approach. Provided extension for LHD application.
143 Understand significance. Want to request lift in June. Spoke to Town Counsel, he agrees with this
144 process.
145
146 Kyle Sheffield – bump out – separate from main roof. Could provide photos.
147
148 No public comment
149
150 David King – like a Japanese temple. Uphold.
151
152 David Jack – agrees.
153
154 Jim Batchelor – thanks everyone for handling for case.
155
156 Kyle Sheffield – Thanks Valerie Birmingham.
157
158 David King – motion uphold significant. David Jack second.
159 All vote in favor
160
161 Elton Elperin – path forward? Should we address plans? Preservation of garage? Ask applicants to
162 respond to this. Moving it?
163
164 Bob Allen – yes, we can address that. Our proposal was for not visible. Talk more in June.
165
166 Valerie Birmingham – continuing COA until June, Commission should acknowledge that.
167
168 Elton Elperin – motion continue to June for COA and lift.
169
170 David Jack second.
171
172 All vote in favor
173
174
175 **6 Wellington Terrace (Pill Hill LHD)** –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to reside 165
176 sq ft of the barn rear wall and repair puddingstone retaining wall (David & Linda Hamlin, applicants).
177 **Precinct 5**
178
179 David & Linda Hamlin – needs repair, we put up staging. Want fire protection. Difficult to get to
180 main barn sided with cement asbestos shingles. Hardie is maintenance free for decades. Don't think
181 the shed is original to 1890. Distance to street makes it not possible to tell.
182
183 Public Comment
184
185 Omar Mabrook – 10 Rice Street, abutters. Support repairs. Want to ensure structural safety of wall.
186 Rocks fall, could squish kids. No issue with Hardie.
187
188 David King – in the past there have been exceptions due to fire code. May be an exception here.
189

190 David Hamlin – Mark Keleher mason said he would dry lay as possible and hide any necessary mortar.
191 Mason will decide as he proceeds. Problems are around corner at 14 Rice Street. Tree there tore it up.
192 Removed tree.
193
194 Elton Elperin – seems to be special case. Cedar will last 10-20 years unpainted.
195
196 Jim Batchelor – comfortable with Hardie. Wall is good. Other wood siding can be kept.
197
198 Linda Hamlin – side wall can be wood.
199
200 Elton Elperin – motion approve as submitted, due to special circumstances of location on property line.
201 Fire and maintenance issue.
202 David King second. All vote in favor.
203
204
205
206 Meeting adjourned.

DRAFT