

Minutes of the Building Commission Meeting

Monday, August 24, 2020
Remote Meeting Via Webex
5:30 p.m.

In Attendance: Janet Fierman, Ken Kaplan, George Cole, Nathan Peck, Karen Breslawski, Building Commission; Tony Guigli, Project Administrator; Dan Bennett, Building Commissioner; Jim Rogers, Matt Casey, Leftfield Staff; Philip Gray, Carol Harris, Jonathan Levi Architects (JLA) Staff; Lynda Callahan, Walt Kincaid, Joe McCoy, Gilbane Staff; Carlos DeSousa, GGD; Chris Erikson, Nicholas Hodge, Joe Lombardo, Jonathan Patch, McPhail Associates; Mary Ellen Normen, School Department; Helen Charlupski, Susan Wolf-Ditkoff, School Committee; Carla Benka, David Leschier, Advisory Committee; Diane Sokal, Tommy Vitolo, Victor Kusmin, Werner Lohe, Members of the Public.

Driscoll School Project

There were two items presented by Leftfield Associates: 1) the scope and cost of McPhail Associates Analysis and 2) discussion of Geothermal as a Value Engineering (VE) consideration.

M. Casey provided a summary on the Geothermal and the Air Source Heat Pumps as a VE option. Discussion took place on these two options. See chart below.

	Geothermal	Air Source Heat Pumps
All Electric	Yes	Yes
Thermal Comfort and Fresh Air to Classrooms	Unchanged	Unchanged
Capital Cost	In current estimate	Savings over \$2M
Operating Costs	Lower energy costs and maintenance costs. 25 year payback period	Higher energy costs and maintenance costs.
Lifecycle cost	Over 30 years, projected to be \$476,310 lower	Higher lifecycle cost
Maintenance	Simpler	More frequent capital replacements (additional at 3 years and 10 years)
Schedule	Current Schedule	No change to move-in date. Could possibly allow use of new park and playground about 1 month earlier.
Site Use	Current Design	Current Design
Neighbor impacts	No difference	No difference

Bidding Complexity	Could be included as an alternate with large impacts to HVAC and site. If overall number of alternates are limited, this should not adversely affect bidding	Same.
Environmental	Most energy efficient	Uses about 1/3 more electricity. Some reduction in roof area for photovoltaics.

C. DeSousa said among the differences between the two systems is the maintenance aspect. Air Source requires more maintenance every three years for the lifecycle of the equipment. Leftfield discussed this with Town Buildings Officials and agreed that it is more favorable to have less maintenance. T. Guigli reported that C. Simmons is concerned that the 25 year payback period may be too long and may favor keeping it as an alternate.

M. Casey provided a Mechanical System Payback Summary by GGD and Gilbane. The Gross Capital Investment estimated by GGD's numbers are under \$2M apart and Gilbane's numbers are about \$2.4M apart. One of the advantages of having this as an alternate is they would get the bids in and there would be a definitive capital cost difference between the two systems.

J. Levi stated that there would be no cost to the Town of Brookline for the design of the alternate. He wants to provide a project below budget.

Based on a question by the Building Commission J. Lombardo reported that the biggest expense is having a non-filed sub-bidder for the well drillers. It is impacted by three trades: well drillers, mechanical and electrical.

J. Patch reported that the design of the wells they were able to modify the design perimeters allowing for the reduction of net total wells. There are a total of 50 wells, 49 are new and one is existing. They hope to get the number down to 40 which will bring the costs down.

Building Commission discussed that environmental discussions of the two options are more of a School Committee decision. It is up to the School Committee if they want a more energy efficient schools for ethical or educational reasons. J. Levi confirmed that energy efficiency has been in the program since February 2019. S. Wolf-Ditkoff said it is a combination decision by the Select Board, Building Commission and the School Committee.

T. Vitolo is in favor of the geothermal option.

After discussion, Building Commission supports creating an ad-alt for the geothermal and carry the heat pumps as the base and adjust the design accordingly at no additional cost to the Town. S. Wolf-Ditkoff supports this as well as Gilbane. Leftfield will move forward in this direction.

The McPhail Analysis was discussed. M. Casey provided a summary of the current costs up to date, pending costs and forecasted costs. He reviewed McPhail Amendment #'s 3, 5, and 7 and the total to date of these costs including the JLA Markup is \$518,180. Pending scope and costs for Amendment # 9 including the JLA Markup is \$42,900. They have a projected potential future scope costs for including the JLA markup for a total of \$246,312.

J. Lombardo explained two scopes of work for Amendment # 9 and why they were not anticipated at the beginning and what is involved. The first scope was Groundwater Chemical Testing and RNF testing that was done to follow up on two spots of release conditions to soil on borings 106 and 303. The second scope was the MCP-Related Compliance Reports for DEP was a series of compliance reports required by DEP under the Massachusetts Contingency Plan (MCP) necessary for release conditions that are reported to the DEP. These reports include a plan, a completion report, status reports, method 3 risk characterization and permanent solution statement.

Motion made by J. Fierman to approve the Pending Scope and Fee for Amendment # 9 in the amount of \$42,900.

Yea: Kaplan, Breslawski, Peck, Cole, Fierman

By Roll Call Vote Approved.

M. Casey reviewed the Projected Potential Future Scope and Fee. There will need to be additional testing for petroleum in boring 303.

Building Commission expressed that they need to look at the budget and look at things critically and ask do we really need it and why. J. Rogers recommended taking the costs out of Construction budget. J. Levi said it is usually taken out of Project costs and not Construction costs. After discussion, it was decided to keep it in the Project costs rather than Construction costs.

Old and New Business

None.

Meeting adjourned at 6:40 p.m.

Minutes respectfully submitted by Beth McDonald.