TOWN OF BROOKLINE
MASSACHUSETTS

REPORTS OF SELECTMEN AND ADVISORY COMMITTEE

on the

Articles in the Warrant

for the

SECOND SPECIAL TOWN MEETING

I hereby certify that the actions as indicated on the within pages were taken at the Special Town Meeting called for Tuesday, May 23, 2017, at 8:30 P.M., adjourned to and reconvened at 9:42 P.M., and dissolved at 10:05 P.M., on Tuesday, May 23, 2017.

ATTEST:

Patrick Joseph Ward
Town Clerk

(Please retain this copy for use at the Town Meeting)

Town of Brookline

BOARD OF SELECTMEN

Neil A. Wishinsky, Chairman

Benjamin J. Franco

Nancy S. Heller

Bernard W. Greene

Heather A. Hamilton

Melvin A. Kleckner, Town Administrator

"The Town of Brookline does not discriminate on the basis of disability in admission to, access to, or operation of its programs, services or activities. Persons with disabilities who need auxiliary aids and services for effective communication in programs, services and activities of the Town of Brookline are invited to make their needs and preferences known to Lloyd Gellineau, Town of Brookline, 11 Pierce Street, Brookline, MA 02445, 730-2328 Voice, 730-2327 TDD, or email at lgellineau@brooklinema.gov."

MODERATOR

Edward N. Gadsby, Jr.

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Sean M. Lynn-Jones, Chair, 53 Monmouth Street 738-6228
Carla Benka, Vice-Chair, 26 Circuit Road 277-6102
Clifford M. Brown, 9 Hyslop Road 232-5626
Carol Caro, 1264 Beacon Street, #2 739-9228
Lea Cohen, 1060 Beacon Street, #11 947-9713
John Doggett, 8 Penniman Place 739-7266
Dennis Doughty, 57 Perry Street 566-5474
Harry Friedman, 27 Clafin Road 232-0122
Janet Gelbart 216 St. Paul Street #601 566-5616
David-Marc Goldstein, 22 Osborne Road 232-1943
Neil Gordon, 87 Ivy Street ..... (508)265-1362
Kelly Hardebeck, 18 Littell Road 277-2685
Amy Hummel, 226 Clark Road 731-0549
Sytske V. Humphrey, 46 Gardner Road 277-1493
Angela Hyatt, 87 Walnut Street 734-3742
Alisa G. Jonas, 333 Russett Road 469-3927
Janice Kahn, 63 Craftsland Road 739-0606
Steve Kanes, 89 Carlton Street 232-2202
Bobbie M. Knable, 243 Mason Terrace 731-2096
David Lescohier, 50 Winchester Street 383-5935
Fred Levitan, 1731 Beacon Street 734-1986
Robert Liao, 55 Meadowbrook Road ..... (530)988-8887
Pamela Lodish, 195 Fisher Avenue 566-5533
Shaari S. Mittel, 309 Buckminster Road 277-0043
Mariah Nobrega, 33 Bowker Street 935-4985
Michael Sandman, 115 Sewall Ave., No. 4 232-7125
Lee L. Selwyn, 285 Reservoir Road 277-3388
Stanley L. Spiegel, 39 Stetson Street 739-0448
Charles Swartz, 69 Centre Street 731-4399
Christine M. Westphal, 31 Hurd Road 738-7981

Lisa Portscher, Executive Assistant, Town Hall 730-2115

MAY 23, 2017
SECOND SPECIAL TOWN MEETING
INDEX

ARTICLE NO.	TITLE
1.	FY2018 Special Appropriation for Brookline High School Expansion Project (Board of Selectmen)

2017 SPECIAL TOWN MEETING WARRANT REPORT

The Board of Selectmen and Advisory Committee respectfully submit the following report on Articles in the Warrant to be acted upon at the 2017 Special Town Meeting to be held on Tuesday, May, 23, 2017 at 8:30 p.m.

Note: The following pages of this report are numbered consecutively under each article.

ARTICLE 1

BOARD OF SELECTMEN'S SUPPLEMENTAL RECOMMENDATION

Article 1 was submitted to allow for consideration of "Option 4", the 111 Cypress acquisition. On May 3, the High School Building Committee selected an option which includes use of 111 Cypress Street as its preferred design alternative. 111 Cypress Street is a parcel at the corner of Brington Road and Cypress St, which is currently occupied by a two-story office building and an associated parking lot. The parcel will need to be acquired by the Town and may require use of the Town's eminent domain authority. Town Meeting must approve any acquisition (or disposal) of real estate. This will occur at a future Town Meeting.

On May 9, 2017, a unanimous Board of Selectmen voted FAVORABLE ACTION on the motion offered by the Advisory Committee.

ARTICLE 1

FIRST ARTICLE
Submitted by: Board of Selectmen

Appropriate $1,850,000, or any other sum, to be expended under the direction of the Building Commission, with any necessary contracts over $100,000 to be approved by the Board of Selectmen and the School Committee, for the phase two feasibility/schematic design related to the off-site building expansion of the High School, or the remodeling, renovating, reconstruction or making extraordinary repairs to the High School; and to meet the appropriation authorize the Treasurer, with the approval of the Board of Selectmen, to borrow $1,850,000, under General Laws, Chapter 44, Section 7, Clause 21.

or act on anything relative hereto.

PETITIONER'S ARTICLE DESCRIPTION

At the High School Building Committee's sixth public meeting, HMFH Architects presented a new expansion concept and design options. Options 4A, 4B, 4C, and 4D include a new 9th Grade Academy that would be located on Cypress Street and have additional renovations at the main building on Greenough Street. The 9th Grade Academy would include classrooms for all subjects, art and music classrooms, a cafeteria and a library as well as collaborative learning spaces. The main building options include building new science classrooms, and a range of renovations of existing classrooms. Given the emergence of this option, the special appropriation language under the Annual Town Meeting (Article 9) was reviewed with the Moderator. "Option 4" was ruled to be outside the scope; therefore, it is necessary to have the Board create a new warrant with amended language in order to allow for consideration of this option.

SELECTMEN'S RECOMMENDATION

The Board of Selectmen will have their public hearing on this article on May 9, 2017. A report and recommendation on this article will be in the supplemental mailing.

ADVISORY COMMITTEE'S RECOMMENDATION

SUMMARY:
FY2018 CIP funds in the amount of $1,850,000 have been requested to complete the Feasibility Study for the Expansion of Brookline High School and to fund the Schematic Design phase of the project. The latter will conclude with a document that includes further analyses for Traffic, Siting, and Environmental and Geotechnical issues, as well as a project schedule, site development plan, construction cost estimate, and schematic floor plans and exterior building elevations.

By a vote of 26–1–0, the Advisory Committee recommends FAVORABLE ACTION on appropriating $1,850,000 for Feasibility 2/Schematic Design services.

BACKGROUND:

1. *Ongoing Feasibility Study*

The first phase of the Brookline High School (BHS) Expansion Project, as discussed further below, has been a Feasibility Study, undertaken by HMFH Architects, Inc. and financed with FY2017 CIP funds. It had been scheduled to be completed in April, but is now not expected to be completed until early June.

HMFH's work produced a range of options, eventually reduced to three and presented to the Building Committee for the Brookline High School Expansion Project (BHS Building Committee) in mid-March. A fourth option emerged in mid-April, but it needs more investigation of parking and traffic issues as well as further assessment of environmental issues and additional survey work. An additional $350,000 for further study of these matters ("Feasibility 2") is being requested in Article 1 of the second Special Town Meeting of May 2017 in order to complete the Feasibility Study phase of this project. Article 1 of the second Special Town Meeting also includes $1,500,000 for Schematic Design, for a total appropriation of $1,850,000. (This appropriation is also listed as part of the special appropriations/CIP proposals in the FY2018 Town budget presented in Article 9 of the 2017 Annual Town Meeting.)

2. *School Department Projection of Increased BHS Capacity Need*

School department studies show that Brookline High School (BHS) is at the beginning of rapid enrollment growth that will see an increase from 1,800 students in 2015 to at least 2,600 or more students by 2023. This growth has already resulted in a shortage of classrooms and a significant number of classes larger than the size that best promotes learning. Science laboratories are too small to accommodate laboratory demonstrations by faculty and do not meet the square footage requirements under Massachusetts State High School standards. Overcrowded dining facilities have resulted in dividing some classes into

two parts to allow students to eat. The growth in the school population is expected to reach 2,700 in less than a decade, increasing the effects of space shortages on the quality of education.

3. *Preliminary Steps*

Four years ago, recognizing the coming increase in High School enrollment, the B-SPACE Committee recommended maximizing BHS's use via efficiency and/or expansion. As a result, the School Committee requested School Department staff to begin a process of analyzing the pedagogical and administrative implications of serving up to 2,500 high school students, with a resultant plan and educational program for an expanded school that could include "new or revamped programs, staffing and administrative structures, and facilities use."

Increasing the number of general education classrooms and special education and support spaces, addressing the limited capacity of existing "common spaces" such as the library/media center, cafeteria, and athletic facilities, and reconfiguring existing or building 24 new science labs were identified as necessary steps to serve a larger student body. Options and recommendations offered in three studies—the HMFH Architects, Inc. High School Concept Study, the B-SPACE Committee Report, and the Symmes Maini & McKee Associates (SMMA) study from 2015—were to be considered, along with other possibilities for expansion.

In 2014, community visioning sessions were held and included BHS teachers, district administrators, BHS administrators, BHS students and parents, members of the School Committee, Building Commission, Planning Board, Board of Selectmen, and business community. Additional visioning sessions were held for BHS faculty. At the end of the visioning process, BHS Culture and Core Values had been better defined and clarified and guiding principles for the design of the expansion project had been laid out. These included the concept of "Big School, Small Feel" in a facility that would be green and sustainable, conducive to the collaboration between departments and disciplines, and finally, supportive of both experiential learning and independent and group study and learning. Three programmatic options–expanding the current campus, one high school on two campuses, and two self-contained high schools–also emerged from these sessions.

In June 2016, the BHS Expansion Working Group, made up of BHS teachers, staff, coordinators, district administrators, and School Committee members, held a community meeting to share its two-year's worth of research, its conclusions, a potential timeline for the expansion process, and next steps. Included in its proposed schedule was site selection/feasibility beginning in the early fall of 2016, a debt exclusion vote in November 2017, ground breaking for 19 months of construction in January 2019, and school opening in early September 2021.

4. *Feasibility Study Process*

At the end of June 2016, a Request for Qualifications (RFQ) for the preparation of a Feasibility Study for a new High School or additions/renovations to the existing High School was issued. HMFH Architects, Inc. was selected and with input the BHS Building Committee and administrative support from Town Hall staff, began its work in November 2016. HMFH has met on a monthly basis with the BHS Building Committee, consisting of representatives from the Board of Selectmen, School Committee, Building Commission and Department, Park and Recreation Commission, and Advisory Committee as well as from the High School parent community and greater BHS community, along with the High School Headmaster, Town Administrator, and Superintendent of Schools. It has also sponsored two well-attended community meetings.

At the Committee's March 2017 meeting, three program levels with accompanying cost estimates were presented. The projected costs ranged from **$181,572,560** for Option 1 to **$348,352,647** for Option 3, but none contemplated renovating Cypress Field/Playground or providing additional parking accommodations.

5. *Options*

Information on Options 1-4 is based upon the HMFH presentation made at the April 26th public hearing, which can be accessed at http://www.brookline.k12.ma.us/cms/lib8/MA01907509/Centricity/Domain/722/BHS%20-%20Sch.Bldg.Comm.Mtg.%202017%2004.27.pdf.

Option 1, at **$181,572,560**, responds only to the need to accommodate 2,700 students at BHS and to improve the Science Department's facilities. Under Option 1, 62 existing classrooms remain and 30 new classrooms, along with 24 new science classrooms/labs, would be added. This scheme also proposes to renovate and expanded the cafeteria, relocate and renovate the library, make minor additions to the collaborative learning commons, and create both a new Black Box performance space and a new Chorus space. For an additional $13,290,000, minimal renovation of the Tappan Street gym could take place with this option.

Option 2, guided by general conformance to standards used for other Massachusetts high schools, is estimated to cost **$212,261,728** with no improvements to the Tappan Street Gym, and **$271,178,244** with the Tappan Street gym renovated and expanded. This option would retain 38 existing classrooms and adds 57 new classrooms and 24 new science classrooms/labs. It would renovate and expand the cafeteria, create a new and larger library, add 16 small group rooms, replace the Black and White Box theatres, and create new Band and Chorus space. It also would eliminate the Schluntz Gym and add a Competition Gym to a moderately renovated Tappan Street gym.

Option 3, projected to cost **$348,352,647**, would implement the goals set forth by the community during visioning sessions and set out in the Education Plan. (http://www.brookline.k12.ma.us/cms/lib8/MA01907509/Centricity/Domain/722/EdPlan

v5-10Feb17-SCReview.docx.pdf) It provides for 40 existing classrooms, 58 new classrooms, and 24 science classrooms/labs. Option 3 also would create both a new and larger cafeteria and library and make significant additions to the learning commons. Finally, it would replace the White and Black Box theatres, add a 400-seat theatre, renovate the Tappan Street gym, and expand that facility through the addition of a Competition Gym and a Field House.

It should be noted that a significant portion of the costs for Options 1, 2, and 3 relate to code compliance, triggered by investing more than $21 million in the existing structure(s). The level of investment means that current building code standards are retroactively applied to older structures, even if those structures complied with the existing code when they were built.

Option 4, which proposes a new building at 111 Cypress Street (see below for discussion of this property), with four variations ranging in price from **$105,342,903 to $136,612,807, exclusive of land acquisition cost**, emerged after the projected costs of Options 1–3 had been evaluated by the BHS Expansion Committee. Option 4's different schemes were presented by HMFH to the BHS Building Committee on April 13. All of the variants of Option 4 include both construction of an academic building at 111 Cypress Street as well as renovations and some new construction at the main academic building on Greenough Street.

One proposed use for the 111 Cypress Street building, which has been very well received, is a 9th Grade Academy. It would include classrooms for all subjects, art and music classrooms, a cafeteria and a library as well as collaborative learning spaces. Construction at the existing Greenough Street building would consist of creating new or renovating existing classrooms and creating 24 new science classrooms/labs. The range of prices is mostly attributable to renovating the existing science facilities and building a new five-classroom addition to the Tappan Street wing as opposed to building a new "STEM" wing and repurposing the current third floor for core academics.

6. *111 Cypress Street*

The property at 111 Cypress Street was considered for High School expansion over a year ago, but was not pursued at that time. The February 10, 2016 report to the Advisory Committee from the Capital Subcommittee+2 noted:

One possible location for such expansion is 111 Cypress Street, a site currently used for office space, assessed for approximately $10 million, and with development potential for 40B housing. A number of committee members thought that the Town should start to explore an eminent domain taking immediately. The Chair of the School Committee questioned whether a 2700 student high school was an educationally sound idea, whether 111 Cypress Street could provide the square footage necessary to accommodate an additional 600-800 students (changes to existing zoning would be required or the Dover

Amendment utilized as it was at Runkle), and whether the traffic and parking problems accompanying a 2700 student campus could be satisfactorily addressed.

If some version of Option 4 were approved, additional investigation of how to access the 111 Cypress Street site from the main campus would be needed. One possibility would be to build a platform or plaza over the MBTA tracks. The T has been approached about the possibility of building over the tracks and more conversations are anticipated, should Option 4 be deemed the "Preferred Option." If building over the tracks were deemed too complicated or expensive, students would have a somewhat longer walk, approaching the site via Cypress Street.

It should be noted that one other nearby parcel of land was considered for expansion. A Town-owned parcel of approximately three-quarters of an acre, on the other (south) side of the MBTA tracks behind the Tappan Street athletic facility, was considered early in the work of the BHS Building Committee. However, certain characteristics of this site, including its slope and limited vehicular access via a ten-foot easement via Brington Road, were viewed as significantly reducing its utility for the High School's academic expansion in a practical and cost-effective manner. The site could hold potential for the expansion of the Tappan Street gym complex, providing new construction could span the MBTA tracks.

7. *Next Steps – Schematic Design*

On May 3, the BHS Building Committee voted to make Option 4D its "Preferred Option," favoring the addition of a new wing with 24 science classrooms/labs in the Greenough Street building and the construction of a new building at 111 Cypress Street that extends over the MBTA tracks to Tappan Street. These concepts will be explored more fully in the next phase of the project, after further environmental site assessments, scope and schedule for geotechnical exploration, and additional traffic analysis, all part of "Feasibility 2," are completed.

The second phase of the BHS Expansion Project is Schematic Design, projected to cost $1,500,000. The Schematic Design phase will conclude with a document that includes Traffic, Environmental, Geotechnical, Program, Code, Accessibility, Siting, and Utility analyses, a massing study, a MA-CHPS or LEED-S Scorecard, a description of building systems, project schedule, site development plan, construction cost estimate, and schematic floor plans and exterior building elevations.

DISCUSSION:

Expanding the High School at 111 Cypress Street would result in the removal of the property from the commercial tax base and the loss of $168,000 in tax revenue from that property. The Town would still be able to collect that revenue, but it would require incremental increases in the tax revenue from other properties. Despite these downsides, Advisory Committee members view the development of this site favorably. It is close enough to be considered a part of the campus and offers the additional benefit of avoiding phased construction and reducing disruption to classes since construction there could

precede work on current classroom space. Furthermore, the construction of an entire building on the site will reduce the scope of the work to be done in the main building of the High School, thereby avoiding very costly code compliance work in the main building and making this option cost-effective. Among the advantages of specifically building a Ninth Grade Academy on the site is the alignment of the Academy concept with the BHS Education Plan. Based on comments submitted at various meetings, it appears these plans are supported by nearby neighbors, one of whom suggested that the platform or plaza that might be built across the MBTA tracks as part of the project "could provide access to the Brookline Hills T stop from Brington Road for all users, not just BHS students."

Advisory Committee members, like two of the BHS Building Committee Co-Chairs, are keenly aware that this project is on a very fast track. Several members expressed the concern that working within an extremely tight timeline is more likely to lead to oversights and mistakes. While recognizing the importance of being ready to use the renovated and new buildings at the start of the 2021–22 academic year, nonetheless all agreed that "getting it right" is more important than meeting a schedule that was devised in March 2016.

Advisory Committee members also note that at this time, it is difficult to know what the total projected cost of Option 4 will be since portions of the Feasibility Study have yet to be completed and existing information on such issues as transportation, structured parking, and improvements to the Tappan Street gym require further research and analysis. Currently, estimates for parking below Cypress Field range from $21,051,500 for 100 cars to $46,806,000 for 300 cars. There might also be an option to build a parking facility below 111 Cypress Street. Preliminary estimates for improvements to the Tappan Street gym begin at $13,290,000 for minimal renovations, and projected costs for the renovation of Cypress Field and Cypress Playground total $13,335,500

Finally, there is the question of acquiring the Cypress Street property. Assuming the BHS Building Committee and the School Committee support an option that uses 111 Cypress Street, the means by which the parcel would be acquired will need to be more fully explored. Ultimately, it will be up to Town Meeting to approve the acquisition of the property and to appropriate the funds necessary to do so. In the case of an "unfriendly" taking, an initial pro tanto award allows the Town to take possession of the land and begin using it, but the ultimate cost of acquisition would likely be determined through litigation.

RECOMMENDATION:
Recognizing that additional work on the feasibility of this project, such as the utilization of the site at 111 Cypress Street and a parking needs assessment, needs to be undertaken before the Schematic Design phase can start, and supporting the work that has been done to date on the BHS Expansion Project, by a vote of 26-1-0, the Advisory Committee recommends FAVORABLE ACTION on the appropriation of $1,850,000 to fund Feasibility 2/Schematic Design for the High School Expansion project.

VOTED: That the Town raise and appropriate $1,850,000 to be expended under the direction of the Building Commission, with any necessary contracts over $100,000 to be approved by the Board of Selectmen and the School Committee, for the phase two feasibility/schematic design related to the off-site building expansion of the High School, or the remodeling, renovating, reconstruction or making extraordinary repairs to the High School; and to meet the appropriation authorize the Treasurer, with approval of the Board of Selectmen, to borrow $1,850,000, under General Laws, Chapter 44, Section 7, Clause 21.

XXX

Passed by a Counted Vote of 216 In Favor and 1 Opposed

BOARD OF SELECTMEN

Neil A. Wishinsky, Chair
Benjamin J. Franco
Nancy S. Heller
Bernard W. Greene
Heather A. Hamilton

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Sean Lynn-Jones, Chair